

## PUBLIC ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Wednesday, December 6, 2017  
Baltimore Metropolitan Council  
5:35 to 7:15 P.M.

### MINUTES

Mr. Eric Norton called the meeting to order at 5:35 p.m.

#### 1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The PAC approved the [November 2017](#) meeting minutes.

#### 2. DISCUSSION: PAC STATEMENT ON TRANSPORTATION EQUITY

Mr. Norton reported that the Equity ad hoc committee has been meeting for several months to formulate a policy statement on equity to guide BRTB plans and programs. Mr. Norton reviewed the statement and opened the floor for discussion. Members offered some additions to the intro text and structure of the document. Following discussion, the PAC approved the updated statement.

***[Handout: Policy framework on transportation equity]***

#### 3. SUBCOMMITTEE UPDATES & CURRENT ACTION ITEMS

- **Policy and Legislation** – Mr. Mark Lotz reported the subcommittee reviewed the draft PAC sponsored Leadership Academy [event plan](#), based on the [USDOT Everyplace Counts Leadership Academy](#). Members offered recommendations for sponsors, speakers and the agenda.

The following members volunteered to serve on an ad hoc event planning committee: Ms. Janet Eveland, Mr. Ben Groff, Ms. Yvette Hicks, Mr. Mark Howard, Mr. Norton, Ms. Angela Jones, and Ms. Jennifer Weeks.

- **Public Involvement** – Mr. Norton reported that the subcommittee met before the meeting to continue its review of the 2014 Public Participation Plan. The PAC has an opportunity to provide input into the update of the plan, which is due to be released for public review and comment in late February or early March 2018. At this time, staff are considering a change to the TIP amendment process and minor updates to other elements of the plan.

- **Membership** – The subcommittee, consisting of the 2018 Chairs will review new member applications, as well as requests by current members to renew their term of service, and submit recommendations to the BRTB.

#### **4. ELECTION OF 2018 PAC OFFICERS**

PAC members elected the following individuals for 2018 PAC Chair: Mr. Norton and Vice Chair: Mr. Lotz and Ms. Taffy Gwitira.

#### **5. LOOKING BACK ON 2017 + DISCUSSING FUTURE PAC ACTIVITIES**

Mr. Norton shared highlights of their 2017 cardstorming exercise, reviewed areas of success, and discussed potential future work in 2018. Ideas for 2018 included:

- Hold meetings in other jurisdictions
- Members prepare and read documents
- Focus on action items of BRTB and provide input
- Know major decision points of BRTB's planning process and plan ahead to provide input
- Keep up the excellent lineup of speakers
- Help develop more advocates to be involved in transportation planning
- Focus on more on outcomes of transportation investments like access to jobs, increased economic growth, etc.

Mr. Norton thanked members for these ideas and noted that the PAC will continue discussions on areas of focus for 2018 during the PAC's January meeting.

#### **6. OTHER BUSINESS**

Members and staff made the following announcements:

- **BRTB Meetings** – The November 28 BRTB meeting featured approval of the Hawkins Point TIP amendment and the Patapsco Regional Greenway Concept Plan and Implementation Matrix. Staff are working to finalize details for the next BRTB meeting with elected officials on January 26 at 9 a.m. in Annapolis. Speakers also gave presentations on the MARC/SEPTA Commuter Rail Service Extension Ridership Analysis and an update to the BRTB's Metropolitan Planning Agreements to address additional requirements from the FAST Act and update current practices and procedures. Minutes and a list of upcoming events are online at [baltometro.org](http://baltometro.org).

Mr. Norton and Ms. Monica Haines Benkhedda thanked all of the members for an excellent year of service to the PAC and BRTB. The meeting adjourned at 7:15 P.M.

**ATTENDANCE:**

***Members***

Terraine Arnold – Arunah Avenue Association  
Chris Costello – Transportation Association of Maryland  
William Cowan – South Baltimore Neighborhood Association  
Michael Davis – Resident, Carroll County  
Janet Eveland – Resident, Baltimore City  
Benjamin Gilardi – Resident, Baltimore City  
Ben Groff – Resident, Baltimore City  
Tafadzwa Gwitira – Resident, Baltimore County  
Mark Howard – Resident, Baltimore County  
Angela Jones – Resident, Baltimore County  
Paul Kowzan III – Broadway Area Business Association  
Dick Ladd – Resident, Anne Arundel County  
Mark Lotz – Resident, Harford County  
Eric Norton – Central Maryland Transportation Alliance  
Derrick Sexton – Resident, Baltimore City  
April Stup – Partners in Care  
Jennifer Weeks – Resident, Baltimore County

***Staff and Guests***

Monica B. Haines Benkhedda – Baltimore Metropolitan Council (BMC)  
Don Halligan – BMC

## PAC EQUITY SUBCOMMITTEE

### **BACKGROUND - WHY ARE WE TALKING ABOUT THIS** *(see Appendix 1 for additional information)*

The PAC serves as an advisory body to the BRTB, charged with providing independent, region oriented citizen advice to the BRTB on issues related to the development of the Baltimore Regional Transportation Plan (BRTTP), Unified Planning Work Program (UPWP), Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) and amendments that affect the region's conformity with federal air quality requirements, the public involvement process, regionally significant land use issues, and other regional transportation-related issues, as appropriate, promotes public awareness and participation in the regional transportation planning process and promotes equity in the regional transportation planning process.

Across the nation and in the Baltimore region, there is a clear record of inequity in transportation investments, planning, and construction. As a result, laws and policies have been adopted to prevent discrimination. However, the PAC believes that long-term, structural inequity is harmful to our region and requires an approach that goes beyond anti-discrimination to actively promote inclusion.

### **HOW DO WE DEFINE EQUITY**

Providing what is necessary for all users of the transportation network to achieve their full potential.

### **WHAT DOES IT LOOK LIKE (EQUITY FRAMEWORK/PRINCIPLES)**

The BRTB commits to:

- Ensuring access to mobility and multi modal range of quality of transportation options regardless of age, race, gender, ethnicity, income, location, or physical limitations.
- Creating affordable transportation options for all people
- Ensuring access to quality jobs, workforce development, and contracting opportunities
- Ensuring inclusion, not only as participants but also as decision-makers in planning processes, implementation and evaluation.
- Assessing the distribution of resources, investment, and benefits to explicitly measure outcomes for vulnerable populations as compared to total population or other relevant comparison group.

### **WHO ELSE IS INCORPORATING AN EQUITY FRAMEWORK** *(see Appendix 2 for additional information)*

- Metropolitan Council, Minneapolis-St. Paul
- Puget Sound Regional Council, Seattle
- Boston Region MPO
- City of Baltimore, Department of Planning

### **WHAT THE PAC IS ASKING FOR**

- BRTB adopt an equity framework that provides performance indicators on equity that enable decision-making based on the principles outlined here.
- Apply the equity framework to BRTB work products, including, but not limited to, the long-range plan, the short range plan, amendments, and the UPWP.
- Update the PAC bylaws to reflect the Mission of the PAC, including the promotion of equity.
- Update the PAC bylaws to make the Ad Hoc Equity Subcommittee a standing subcommittee of the PAC.

### APPENDIX 1: BACKGROUND INFO

#### **USDOT - Transportation Equity**

[www.transportation.gov/mission/health/equity](http://www.transportation.gov/mission/health/equity)

Negative health effects related to the transportation system can fall hardest on vulnerable members of the community, such as low-income residents, minorities, children, persons with disabilities, and older adults. Households in low-income areas typically own fewer vehicles, have longer commutes, and have higher transportation costs.

Inadequate or substandard infrastructure in low-income and minority communities can prevent people from using active transportation. It can also make walking and bicycling unsafe for those who do rely on these modes to get around, leading to higher incidences of collisions involving pedestrians and cyclists.

Low-income and minority communities are more likely to be located near highways and other transportation facilities that produce local reduced air quality, and to suffer from negative health effects such as asthma. These communities are also less likely to have convenient access to parks, healthcare, and healthy food.

#### **Transportation Racism: New Routes to Equity by Dr. Robert Bullard**

[drrobertbullard.com/books](http://drrobertbullard.com/books)

While many people view the Civil Rights Act of 1964 as the end of government-sponsored discrimination in the United States, Transportation Racism confirms the obvious and ignored truth: equality in transportation has been established in name only. Case by case, Transportation Racism shows how—a half-century after the Montgomery bus boycotts—chronic inequality in public transportation is firmly and nationally entrenched.

#### **The Third Rail by Alec MacGillis**

[placesjournal.org/article/the-third-rail](http://placesjournal.org/article/the-third-rail)

A recent journal entry by Baltimore resident Alec MacGillis writing for the online journal Places provides an excellent introduction to the history of inequity and segregation in Baltimore through the lens of transportation. The article traces the developments in transportation and its relationship to accessible jobs, white flight, and housing segregation from the early days of street cars that gave rise to the, then, leafy suburban developments in Forest Park and Roland Park, to the recent cancellation of the East-West Red Line by our Republican governor, Hogan—a line that would have connected low income, Black residents from both East and West sides of the city to twin hubs of employment at Social Security and Johns Hopkins Bayview.

#### **Baltimore Red Line Title VI Complaint**

[naacpldf.org/files/case\\_issue/Baltimore%20Red-Line-Complaint.pdf](http://naacpldf.org/files/case_issue/Baltimore%20Red-Line-Complaint.pdf)

The factual narrative and consultant report prepared by EcoNorthwest provide an illustration of historic and more recent inequity in Baltimore transportation planning. A transportation economist, using Maryland's own travel model, found that whites will receive 228 percent of the net benefit from the decision, while African Americans will receive -124 percent.

## APPENDIX 2: WHO ELSE IS INCORPORATING AN EQUITY FRAMEWORK

- Metropolitan Council (Minneapolis-St. Paul MPO)
- Puget Sound Regional Council (Seattle MPO)
- Boston Region MPO
- City of Baltimore, Department of Planning

### MetCouncil (Minneapolis-St. Paul)

[metrocouncil.org/About-Us/why-we-matter/Equity.aspx](http://metrocouncil.org/About-Us/why-we-matter/Equity.aspx)

MetCouncil created a report, *Choice, Place and Opportunity: An equity assessment of the Twin Cities region*.

*“Equity connects all residents to opportunity and creates viable housing, transportation, and recreation options for people of all races, ethnicities, incomes, and abilities so that all communities share the opportunities and challenges of growth and change. For our region to reach its full economic potential, all of our residents must be able to access opportunity. Our region is stronger when all people live in communities that provide them access to opportunities for success, prosperity, and quality of life.”*

MetCouncil identified equity as one of five key regional outcomes from Thrive MSP 2040, alongside stewardship, prosperity, livability and sustainability. In Thrive MSP 2040, the Metropolitan Council commits to using equity as a lens to evaluate its operations, planning and investments. The Council also commits to exploring its authority to use its resources and roles to mitigate the place-based dimension of racial, ethnic and income-based disparities.

### Puget Sound Regional Council (Seattle MPO)

[psrc.org/sites/default/files/equoppsusreport2.pdf](http://psrc.org/sites/default/files/equoppsusreport2.pdf)

Equity, Opportunity, and Sustainability in the Central Puget Sound Region

*“Social equity means that all people, regardless of where they live, have access to the resources and opportunities that improve their quality of life and let them reach their full potential. Social equity also requires that low-income communities, communities of color and other historically underrepresented populations are active participants in planning and policy making by having the knowledge and other tools required for full participation.*

A social equity framework:

- *Ensures that current residents, businesses and other community members benefit as their communities change and grow, rather than being displaced to areas that offer fewer opportunities.*
- *Seeks to ensure that new growth and development create housing choices affordable to socially and economically diverse populations, as well as opportunities for community businesses and institutions to thrive, and employment opportunities that pay a living wage.*
- *Empowers communities to actively participate in planning and policy-making processes and structures planning processes for meaningful community engagement.”*

### **Boston Region MPO**

[ctps.org/equity](https://ctps.org/equity)

The MPO is committed to ensuring that traditionally underserved and underrepresented communities receive a fair share of the regional transportation system's benefits, and are not subject to undue burdens. The MPO considers the needs and views of these populations as it develops its plans, programs, and projects. As such, transportation equity is an important part of the MPO's vision, and is reflected in its goals and objectives.

The MPO's Transportation Equity (TE) program fulfills this vision by ensuring that federally protected populations are not discriminated against in MPO activities, including the programming and planning of transportation projects and studies. The MPO provides outreach opportunities for these populations to participate in its transportation-planning and decision-making processes.

### **Baltimore City, Department of Planning, Office of Sustainability**

Equity in Planning Committee

[planning.baltimorecity.gov/equity-planning-committee#Defining Equity](https://planning.baltimorecity.gov/equity-planning-committee#Defining%20Equity)

The City of Baltimore's Department of Planning staff created and convenes an Equity in Planning Committee (EIPC). Launched in March of 2015, EIPC is driven by a desire to actively work towards dismantling and remedying the legacy of racial inequity that persists in Baltimore.

The EIPC's equity lens considers four overarching areas of equity. For any policy or project, decision makers should consider:

- Structural Equity: *What historic advantages or disadvantages have affected residents in the given community?*
- Procedural Equity: *How are residents who have been historically excluded from planning processes being authentically included in the planning, implementation, and evaluation of the proposed policy or project?*
- Distributional Equity: *Does the distribution of civic resources and investment explicitly account for potential racially disparate outcomes?*
- Transgenerational Equity: *Does the policy or project result in unfair burdens on future generations?*

Equity Lens Statement, Baltimore Sustainability Plan Proposed Draft (2017)

[baltimoresustainability.org/plans/sustainability-plan/update](https://baltimoresustainability.org/plans/sustainability-plan/update)

Using an "equity lens" acknowledges societal inequities that are long-standing and that have their roots in generations of these unfair structural barriers.

An equity lens-- unlike a "universalist" lens, which focuses on sameness-- acknowledges that "...different communities, and hence, the individuals that comprise those communities, are situated differently relative to each other..." It recognizes that "universalist" policies that treat everyone the same continue inequities.